

RESEARCH BRIEFING

MITTROMNEY.COM

FACT CHECK: HUCKABEE AND GIULIANI SUPPORT TUITION BREAKS FOR ILLEGAL IMMIGRANTS



*"Most annoying to some conservatives are Mr. Huckabee's positions on immigration. For many Republicans, immigration is the deal-breaker in judging which candidate is worthy of support. 'Rudy Giuliani spent years defending the right of New York City to remain a sanctuary for illegal aliens. Yet Giuliani was a veritable Lou Dobbs Jr. on illegal immigration in comparison to Mike Huckabee,' said Jim Boulet Jr., executive director of English First, a Springfield, Va., lobbying group." (Ralph Z. Hallow, "Huckabee Stirs Up Third Party Fear," *Washington Times*, 10/29/07)*

In The CNN/YouTube Debate, Mayor Giuliani Claimed His Sanctuary Policies Were Limited To Essential Services:

Mayor Giuliani Said That New York City Only Allowed Illegal Immigrants To Go To School, Report Crimes, And Receive Emergency Medical Care. MAYOR GIULIANI: "New York City was not a sanctuary city. New York City did three exceptions. The three exceptions were to allow children to go to school, to allow those illegal immigrants who were the victims of crime to report the person who assaulted them, beat them up, mugged them. And third, to allow emergency care in the hospitals, which we were required to do by federal law." (CNN/YouTube, Republican Presidential Candidate Debate, St. Petersburg, FL, 11/28/07)

FACT: The Sanctuary Policies Mayor Giuliani Supported Led To Tuition Breaks For Illegal Aliens:

ABC News: "New York Became A Sanctuary City ... Through An Executive Order Signed By Mayor Ed Koch In 1989." "New York became a sanctuary city, where illegal immigrants enjoy some measure of protection, through an executive order signed by Mayor Ed Koch in 1989, five years before Giuliani became mayor in January 1994. But if Giuliani inherited the policy, he reissued it and seemed to embrace it." (Jake Tapper and Ron Claiborne, "Romney: Giuliani's NYC 'Sanctuary' For Illegal Immigrants," ABC News, 8/8/07)

In Response To Executive Order 124, CUNY Gave In-State Tuition To Illegal Immigrants. "Responding to the 1989 Order, CUNY changed its tuition policy, applying the above provision by making undocumented or out-of-status alien students eligible for the resident rate of tuition.[8] This policy allowed undocumented students to pay the resident tuition rate, if they had resided in New York State for twelve months or had attended a New York City high school for the previous two semesters.[9]." ("Report Of The Human Services Division," The Council Of The City Of New York, <http://webdocs.nycouncil.info/>, 5/31/02)

- **"The Policy Was Maintained From 1989 Until 1996 Without Any Comment Or Controversy."** ("Report Of The Human Services Division," The Council Of The City Of New York, <http://webdocs.nycouncil.info/>, 5/31/02)

After Signing Executive Order 124, Koch Praised CUNY's Policy To Give In-State Tuition To Illegal Immigrants. "The City of New York has declared that all undocumented immigrants are eligible for city services

without qualification,' the Mayor said in a letter to the chancellor last week, referring to a policy initiated in 1985. The letter praised the new tuition policy." (Marvine Howe, "CUNY To Enroll Some Illegal Aliens As Residents," *The New York Times*, 8/9/89)

- **"The University Said The Approach Reflected The City's Historic Support For Immigrants And Conformed To Policy Laid Out By Mayor Edward I. Koch In 1989."** (Karen W. Arenson, "Illegal Immigrants At CUNY," *The New York Times*, 10/31/01)

Giuliani Reaffirmed CUNY's Policy Of Giving In-State Tuition To Illegal Immigrants When He Renewed New York's Sanctuary Policy. "CUNY's policy of charging illegal immigrants the lower rate reflected the city's historic embrace of immigrants and conformed to a policy laid out by Mayor Edward I. Koch in 1989 and reaffirmed by Mayors David N. Dinkins and Rudolph W. Giuliani. In reviewing the policy, Mr. Schaffer came across a brief section of a 1996 immigration law that said illegal immigrants should not be eligible for educational benefits not available to American citizens from other states, CUNY officials said. When the law was passed, CUNY lawyers reviewed it and decided that the university should not make changes until regulations were issued to carry out the law. Mr. Schaffer said he concluded, however, that at this point the university had no choice but to change its tuition policy." (Karen W. Arenson, "CUNY Raises Tuition Rates For Foreigners Here Illegally," *The New York Times*, 11/3/01)

As Mayor, Giuliani Actually Invited More Illegal Immigrants To Come To New York. "[Mr. Giuliani said,] 'If you come here and you work hard and you happen to be in an undocumented status, you're one of the people who we want in this city. You're somebody that we want to protect, and we want you to get out from under what is often a life of being like a fugitive, which is really unfair.'" (Deborah Sontag, "New York Officials Welcome Immigrants, Legal Or Illegal," *The New York Times*, 6/10/94)

***The New York Times* Headline, 1994: "New York Officials Welcome Immigrants, Legal Or Illegal"**
<http://query.nytimes.com/gst/fullpage.html?res=940DEFDD133AF933A25755C0A962958260>

In The CNN/YouTube Debate, Gov. Huckabee Claimed He Didn't Support Tuition Breaks For Illegal Aliens:

Gov. Huckabee Said He Did Not Support Giving Illegals Tuition Breaks. GOV. HUCKABEE: "Ashley, first of all let me just express that you're a little misinformed. We never passed a bill that gave special privileges to the children of illegals to go to college." (CNN/YouTube, Republican Presidential Candidate Debate, St. Petersburg, FL, 11/28/07)

Gov. Huckabee Went On To Claim That What He Actually Supported Was Achievement-Based Scholarships, Not Tuition Breaks. GOV. HUCKABEE: "Let me tell you what I did do. I supported the bill that would have allowed those children who had been in our schools their entire school life, the opportunity to have the same scholarship that their peers had, who had also gone to high school with them and sat in the same classrooms. They couldn't just move in in their senior year and go to college. It wasn't about out-of-state tuition, it was an academic meritorious scholarship, called the academic challenge scholarship." (CNN/YouTube, Republican Presidential Candidate Debate, St. Petersburg, FL, 11/28/07)

FACT: The Bill Huckabee Actually Pushed To Pass Granted ONLY In-State Tuition Breaks For Illegals:

The Scholarship Portion Of The Bill Huckabee Supported Was Stripped From The Bill. "The bill began as one touted by Gov. Mike Huckabee to allow undocumented Arkansans to qualify for state-sponsored academic scholarships the same way as legal residents. The governor, who drew criticism from some quarters for backing the proposal, said children who have been good students deserve the same opportunities, regardless of their parents' standing. Hard-liners, led by state Sen. Jim Holt, R-Springdale, said 'illegal aliens,' as they prefer, have no rights because they're lawbreakers. It may not be fair to single Holt out because he had plenty of company. When House Bill 1525 stalled in a Senate committee, the scholarship portion of the bill was stripped out, sending the measure to the Senate floor, where it failed twice, the final time by only two votes." (Dennis Byrd, "Federal Judge: Illegal Immigrants Qualify For Tuition Breaks," *Arkansas News*, 7/10/05; www.arkansasnews.com/archive/2005/07/10/DennisByrd/324273.html)

And The Bill That Was Actually Voted On Only Included In-State Tuition Breaks For Illegals:

- H.B. 1525, "Access To Postsecondary Education Act Of 2005":
www.arkleg.state.ar.us/ftproot/bills/2005/public/HB1525.pdf

Governor Huckabee Fought To Pass The Stripped Bill Which Granted ONLY In-State Tuition Breaks For Illegals. "Other than the highway plan, the only bill in the governor's 21-bill legislative package that failed to win legislative approval was a proposal to make the children of illegal immigrants eligible for state-funded

scholarships and in-state tuition to Arkansas colleges. After passing the House relatively early in the session, the bill faltered in the Senate where it was amended to remove the scholarship provision but fell just short of passage Tuesday and Wednesday. Huckabee said his office worked throughout the day Wednesday for the two Senate votes needed to pass the bill. 'I don't understand the opposition to it, I just honestly don't,' Huckabee said." (Melissa Nelson, "Governor Touts Successful End To Legislative Session," *The Associated Press*, 4/13/05)

***The Washington Post* Recently Noted That Huckabee Has Been Misleading On The Issue.** "On Fox News Wednesday, he was asked about a bill he supported as governor that would have granted tuition breaks to the children of illegal immigrants. He suggested that he had only wanted to give such children access to scholarships. 'What I supported was the idea that if a student had been in our Arkansas high schools and had done academically well to be able to compete for an academic challenged scholarship which was meritorious then that student should be able to have the same opportunity as anyone else,' Huckabee said. In fact, the initial bill he supported did have a scholarship provision. But that provision was later stripped out, and was not included in the legislation that Huckabee continued to push. The bill read: 'Any tuition rate that is granted to residents of Arkansas shall be granted on the same terms to all persons, regardless of immigration status, who have attended a secondary educational institution in Arkansas for at least three (3) years and who have either graduated from an Arkansas high school or received a general education diploma in the state.'" (Michael D. Shear, "Rising in Iowa Polls, Huckabee Now In Crosshairs," *The Washington Post*, http://blog.washingtonpost.com/the-trail/2007/11/15/on_a_roll_in_iowa_huckabee_fac.html, Posted 11/15/07)

Paid for by Romney for President, Inc.
www.MittRomney.com